

**Sharing the Collective Wisdom of Seasoned Practitioners:  
An Under Utilized Source of Practical Knowledge**

---

Dale R. Munson  
Deborah S. Paulson  
ILT – 6720 Research  
Fall 2003

*“None of us is as smart as all of us.” The problems we face are too complex to be solved by any one person or any one functional discipline. Our only chance is to bring people together from a variety of backgrounds and disciplines, that can refract a problem through the prism of complementary minds, allied in common purpose. --Warren Bennis*

*Acquiring knowledge is no guarantee of practical, useful application. Wisdom implies a mature integration of appropriate knowledge, a seasoned ability to filter the inessential from the essential. --Doc Childre and Bruce Cryer*

## Table of Contents

Introduction .....	<b>Error! Bookmark not defined.</b>
Abstract .....	5
Statement of the Problem .....	6
Research Questions .....	7
Methods .....	8
Findings .....	9
Future Actions .....	10
Conclusions .....	13
Reflections .....	15
References.....	16
Acknowledgements.....	17
Appendix A - Questions for Esteemed Advisors .....	18
Appendix B - Questions for Expert Practitioners .....	19
Appendix C - Survey of Desirable Characteristics of a Good Instructor .....	20
Appendix D - Survey Results of Desirable Characteristics of a Good Instructor .....	22
Appendix E - Common Keywords and Phrases Among Interviewees .....	24
Appendix F - Model Release Form .....	25
Appendix G - Expert Opinions on Instructional Effectiveness.....	26

## Introduction

*As I sat in my ILT class at UCD listening to my professor, Dr. Brent Wilson, my mind drifted off to thinking about what it would be like if I were teaching this same class of graduate students. Here was a man with a long list of research articles and teaching experiences to his credit and I was just beginning my journey into the corporate world as an instructional developer/presenter. Just as this wispy thought was leaving my mind, another thought drifted in. This time I saw Brent sitting in a class similar to this one, some 20 years ago. I wondered what he might have been thinking back then and whether he shared the same concerns and anxieties I was feeling.*

*Hmmm...the early 1980s. In my mind's eye I could see students graduating from college with the promise of landing a job in education. Then I fast forwarded to where they are today. All of them had gone through a series of successes, failures, and a whole lot of "lessons learned." These are now the people who have tried countless instructional theories, strategies, and technologies and know what works for them. These are the people who have applied the principles espoused by Piaget, Gagné, Skinner, Vygotsky, and Mager with varying degrees of success. These are the people who now hold the collective wisdom of the ages—a veritable "treasure chest" of information. They may not be able to recite page and verse of book knowledge, but they do know what works in the real world. And, this is a source of knowledge that current graduate students want and need.*

*As I started coming out of my trance-like state, I started thinking about how nice it would be if we had access to these experts and their tried-and-true experiences. The question I posed to myself was: "Given a chance to make a 15-minute presentation to this class, what advice would they have for us? From their perspective, what is important?"*

*The impetus for this research project evolved from those few ephemeral thoughts. It occurred to me that I had all three pieces of the "experience triangle" available to me for this project. There was Brent, a theoretical researcher; Dale Munson, my research partner who has 25+ years of experience in both corporate and government learning environments; and me, the aspiring neophyte, with a strong desire to help others with the same concerns. From his experience, Dale would know the difference between a mediocre trainer and an excellent trainer. His perspective coupled with my naïveté and freshness of being a neophyte, would yield some interesting and worthwhile results.*

*The project goal naturally evolved. We wanted to ask numerous well-seasoned, instructors to share their most deeply held ideas, passions, and theories in order to give students in graduate programs a taste of that certain something. Possibly the projected outcomes would be concrete advice or even that intangible magic that we all recognized in our favorite teachers of the past.*

*--Deborah Paulson*

## **Abstract**

Many graduate students in education-related disciplines across the country undoubtedly wish they could round out their education by combining the best theoretical knowledge with the best collective wisdom found among expert practitioners. Armed with both types of knowledge, aspiring instructional designers and presenters would feel less apprehensive about meeting the expectations of their future employers.

From this perceived need arose three initial questions:

1. What is the definition of an effective instructional designer/presenter and how does one reach such a lofty designation?
2. Is it possible to collect, distill, categorize, index, and present practical wisdom in a form that is useful to graduate students and other interested professionals?
3. Would videotaped interviews with expert practitioners be the best way to impart practical knowledge and allay fears about meeting employer expectations?

This paper provides the results of a feasibility study that was conducted to assess the possibility of developing a one-stop web site that provides answers to these three questions, as well as appraising the potential of hosting such a site long-term.

## Statement of the Problem

In order to be a good instructional developer/presenter, one must possess both theoretical and practical knowledge. Generally speaking, colleges and universities do an excellent job of providing the foundational theoretical elements and some hands-on exercises, but they are, ostensibly, unable to provide all the practical elements, which are best obtained through actual on-the-job experiences.

Since experience is something you don't get until after you need it, this creates an inner anxiety for graduate students preparing to enter the workforce. They recognize the need for practical experience—or the wisdom and perspective that come from experience—but practical experience takes years to accumulate. Isn't there some way to expedite that acquisition of wisdom?

Packaging wisdom is the intention of many how-to and self-help books common in the business world. Theories, models, and practical advice are found in textbooks in any profession, including instructional design. These books are available, but often lack the credibility or authenticity that would be found among real-life experts sitting around the water cooler sharing stories.

That leads to another obvious option: Talk to the experts themselves and get the stories direct from the “horse's mouth”. This is commonly done at professional meetings and occasional guest lectures in class. Many students wish they could hear more advice from people who have “been there and done that” to allay their concerns. Bottom line, it would be nice if new instructional developers (IDs) had someone or someplace to turn that would provide an “antidote for their anxieties”—a place that would be to IDs what the Service Corps of Retired Executives (SCORE) is to aspiring entrepreneurs.

This research project is thus a feasibility study to determine the usefulness of developing a one-stop resource center that provides practical advice in form of books, articles, and videotaped interviews. Research questions focus on the various data collection methods and the best ways to package this information for usability. The long-term goal of the project is to help students become more knowledgeable about practical applications of professional knowledge, which, in turn, will infuse them with self-confidence.

As a result of the research, we intend to provide a data bank of education-related resources for graduate students who want more information on real-world trends and applications. This will include:

- A list of books, magazine and journal articles, and web site references
- A distilled list of effective instructional techniques, both for instructional developers and presenters
- Video clips of interviews with experts who provide their viewpoints on numerous key questions
- A forum for seeking advice and answers to everyday questions about instructional design and presentation

## Research Questions

The following research questions helped guide our activities for this research project.

1. What other attempts have been made to formally document practitioner wisdom in instructional design? Were these attempts successful? What can our project learn from these other efforts?
2. What methods can be applied to help practitioners get access to their knowledge and share it effectively with others?
3. Once experts have been interviewed, how can their stories and advice be stored and represented in a way that is accessible and useful to students and beginning professionals?
4. How can the stories and advice of the experts be evaluated for quality and value? What value do collected stories have among students and beginning professionals?
5. After reviewing the overall project, what recommendations for improving the project can be made?
6. How can we take the knowledge attained from this study to proceed with our personal “stretch” goals?

## Methods

### *Overall design of study*

This is a mixed method case study as defined by the problem articulated above. At the heart of our research were one-on-one, structured interviews with practitioners who have 10+ years of experience in a variety of settings. We interviewed a total of ten people, four of which were videotaped. The videotaped interviews were conducted so our target audience could get a sense of the experts' personalities and their enthusiasm for what they do. In addition to these interviews, we also asked class members to rate the desired characteristics of effective instructors.

### *Participants and collaborators*

We consulted with ten respected people from a variety of educational disciplines (e.g., K-12, college, and industry) and asked them for recommendations of people they consider to be exceptional instructional practitioners. From this list, we selected our ten candidates and videotaped four of them for use in a web site.

### *Literature Review*

The Reference section of this paper contains a listing of the books, articles, and web sites that were referenced during this project. All are excellent resources.

### *Data-collection instruments or methods*

Two data-collection questionnaires were used to solicit information from the recommending advisors and expert practitioners (see Appendices A and B). A third questionnaire was developed for a representative target audience, which, for this study, consisted of UCD cohorts. The questionnaire and results are located in Appendices C and D, respectively.

### *Data analysis*

Based on the recommendations of the esteemed advisors, we selected ten practitioners to interview. From this list, we conducted preliminary interviews to determine who was willing to be video recorded. In both cases, we asked the interviewees a series of questions to help direct their thinking. From their answers, we analyzed the data for similarities and patterns in the responses and summarized our finding in tabular form (see Appendix E).



## Findings

Our findings for each of the research questions are provided below.

***What other attempts have been made to formally document practitioner wisdom in instructional design? Were these attempts successful? What can our project learn from these other efforts?***

As a result of our research, we determined that there was considerable information available about real-world, practical advice in the form of books, journal articles, and web sites. But, it was all disjunctive, “islands of information,” similar to individual pieces of a jigsaw puzzle. Also, nowhere did we find video clips of interviews with experts.

From this, we learned that the “value add” to IDs would come from distilling the information, finding a common thread, and assembling the “puzzle pieces” in a meaningful way so users could see the total picture.

We also learned two important things about video clips. First, some people have expertise in instructional design and stand-up instruction that is never captured, because the experts are unwilling (or don't have the time) to write down why they are successful, but they are willing to talk about it to respectful, admiring graduate students. The second thing we learned in this regard is that, while some information in written form is valuable, video clips appear to be a more effective medium. With video, the target audience can hear the intonation of the speaker's voice, which adds credibility to the ideas being communicated. The audience is not only entertained, but they are also enlightened by the speaker's viewpoints, because they get a chance to experience his/her passion for the subject material.

The following quotes support this assertion.

*As educators, our goal of course, is to get students energized and engaged in hands-on learning experiences, and video is clearly an instructional medium that generates excitement. Using sight and sound, video is the perfect medium for students who are auditory or visual learners. Video taps into emotions which stimulate and enthrall students, and it provides an innovative and effective means for educators to address the curricular concepts (Griffin, 2003).*

*Recorded interviews are a powerful addition to the pedagogical toolbox of any construction instructor. For example, a brief video clip of the course textbook's author introducing a topic can entice students to read the book better than any coaxing or threatening attempted by the instructor (Senior, 2002).*

***What methods can be applied to help practitioners get access to the experts' knowledge and how can that knowledge be shared effectively with others?***

Books, journal articles, and web sites can provide some assistance in transferring knowledge from the experts to graduate students and others seeking to know the secrets of their success. The key term in the above question is 'effectively.' We found that, in addition to the resources listed above, it would be extremely beneficial if people had access to forums, FAQ databases, and expert opinions from those who had "been there and done that."

Obviously, it would be ideal if knowledge seekers had 24x7 access to these experts or could occasionally attend seminars where they the experts were speaking on specific topics of interest. But since mentor/protégé relationships are impossible, the next best thing is a database filled with a variety of expert speakers, each providing snippets of information on these same topics. This way, the users get what they need in easily digestible chunks from people they know and respect.

***Once experts have been interviewed, how can their stories and advice be stored and represented in a way that is accessible and useful to students and beginning professionals?***

The best way to access the experts' stories and advice is to meta-tag each article and video clip that is entered into the website database. By providing website users with a good site map, list of key words, and a search function, they should be able to access any information within a matter of a few seconds.

***How can the stories and advice of the experts be evaluated for quality and value? What value do collected stories have among students and beginning professionals?***

The quality and value of anything is based on the opinions of those who need and use it. For that reason, we have incorporated an online survey to elicit feedback, both in terms of content and usability. We intend to use follow-up surveys and questionnaires to determine what can be done to provide better, more appropriate content.

***After reviewing the overall project, what recommendations for improving the project can be made? (Future Actions)***

The project, which was originally intended to be merely a feasibility study for developing an all inclusive web site for beginning instructional designers, has already been expanded to include a web site called the *Practical Side*. The front page for this site is shown in Figure 1, on the next page.



**Figure 1. Home Page of Practical Side Web Site**

It is our intention to continue assimilating and synthesizing as much information as possible from the collective wisdom of numerous expert practitioners. From this distilled information we will uncover more and more common threads of effective practices that can be shared with others at a one-stop location. That's where the Practical Side web site comes into play. This web site will provide a variety of resources for people seeking answers to real-world instructional issues. There will be recommended books, articles, and links, plus open forums for asking questions and sharing lessons learned. Punctuating the site will be videotaped interviews by seasoned practitioners from K-12, higher education, and corporations.

The following improvements will be made to this site in the immediate future:

- Continue to add resources and expand the number and scope of videotaped interviews
- Meta-tag all information to facilitate easy access
- Incorporate a Content Management System, which will make it easier to add web pages
- Improve the quality of video and audio segments
- Limit the Flash elements to the home page only
- Add a site map
- Provide written dialog for the audio/video segments

***How can we take the knowledge attained from this study to proceed with our personal “stretch” goals?***

There were three “stretch” goals that we established early on in the project: 1) to develop a web site, 2) to continue our research and hopefully publish our results, and 3) teach a train-the-trainer course on real-world considerations for beginning instructional designers.

We already have a good start on designing the web site, Practical Side, and will continue to add a variety of resources to it. Next, we will concentrate on some usability issues and marketing the site. Site improvements will evolve based on the feedback we receive from our constituents, either through the survey on the site, peer evaluations, and/or e-mail.

We will pursue getting published when we feel that the results are worthy of sharing with our colleagues. We want to have a publication that is unique in its value and representative of a significant amount of solid research.

Providing seminars/classes that speak to real-world instructional issues will be a long term goal that will be a natural extension of the web site results as well as the experience that we will gain in future years. As we become the experts in determining what makes an effective instructor/instructional designer, we will create these seminars to present to businesses and educational institutions.

## Conclusions

The impetus for this research study began with three questions—questions that we had been asking ourselves long before this class started. The questions:

1. What is the definition of an effective instructional designer/presenter and how does one reach such a lofty designation?
2. Is it possible to collect, distill, categorize, index, and present practical wisdom in a form that is useful to graduate students and other interested professionals?
3. Would videotaped interviews with expert practitioners be the best way to impart practical knowledge and allay fears about meeting employer expectations?

From here, we established some broad research objectives about what it takes to become not only an effective instructor, but a stellar performer in the field. We set out with some lofty objectives and goals, but thanks to the guidance of our professor, Dr. Brent Wilson, our scope was narrowed to something more manageable and more easily attainable within the time constraints of the course. The early focus was narrowed to: What is the best way to capture the collective wisdom of expert practitioners in the field? Is it possible to store the information in such a way that it is both easily accessible and useful to the target audience, which essentially is graduate students and other newcomers to the field of instructional design? Finally, are videotaped interviews any more useful than textual versions of the same information? Research questions were thus established to provide boundaries for our research.

The research itself turned out to be extremely rewarding. We couldn't help but notice the passion each of our interviewees had for their respective careers. They spoke with candor and as a result we learned a lot. In several one-hour time slots we absorbed information about a variety of "lessons-learned" in the real-world. They were the mentors—the expert practitioners—and we were the protégés, taking in every word and appreciating their unique and valuable insights. There was no doubt in either of our minds that this type of information, caught on camera, would be beneficial to would-be instructional designers and instructors.

Our original goals were to satisfy the course requirements by finding answers to our research questions, revealing the results of our study via this paper, and preparing a PowerPoint presentation so we could share our findings with our classmates. Developing a web site was a secondary goal, but it soon became evident that, if we wanted to truly show the effectiveness of our research, we would have to take this next step. The *Practical Side* web site provides a cross section of resources we think will be useful to our target audience. It is expected that the video clips of the experts, talking about a variety of issues, will be a reason to return to the site again and again.

Overall, we believe in the long-term viability of the Practical Side web site. We believe that a one-stop source of information is the way to go. Site visitors can select from a variety of books or articles, link to other interesting sites, search for topics of interest, or participate in forum discussions about germane issues. From quotes, key words, and resume help, to specific assistance with a difficult issue, the *Practical Side* site will ultimately provide everything a graduate student or beginning instructor should need to begin their journey into the field of instruction. Will it work? Will it be a useful tool? Time will tell.

## Reflections

Reflecting on the entire research project that spanned an entire semester is overwhelming. We can honestly say that we absorbed a tremendous amount of valuable wisdom during the course of our studies and that our personal goals were attained.

We started with naïve optimism that the research would be clean and clear-cut with a linear task list. As our scope grew and grew, it became apparent that we needed to be reined in, which is exactly what our professor, Brent Wilson, did for us. Even then, we thought we could do more than we actually accomplished. We planned on conducting six or seven taped interviews and actually taped four. We planned on creating a database with keywords and only touched upon a possible method of accomplishing this.

The purpose of the research was to find a way to expedite the acquisition of wisdom. We set up the pilot study of videotaping and interviewing seasoned practitioners and put the information on a website. Through this process, we were enriched by the words of everyone around us. Discussing wisdom develops wisdom, and we were the fortunate beneficiaries.

Our personal conclusions: We feel that individual mentoring is the most essential component of ensuring the evolution of a competent, confident instructor or instructional designer. We know that this method is extremely inefficient and costly, but we believe that a half day of one-on-one with an expert is more valuable than a month of classes. It seems that the apprentices of yesteryear had a good thing going. The role modeling, hands-on demonstrations, and human contact add an element that is irreplaceable.

Hopefully, our concept of placing video clips of experts will grow in quality and quantity to become the “next best thing to being there.” We feel that we have formed a healthy and strong foundation that is well-prepared for more and more information to be placed into the pages of the *Practical Side*.

## References

- Center for Teaching Effectiveness (1999). *Teachers and students*. Retrieved October 3, 2003, from <http://www.utexas.edu/academic/cte/sourcebook/teachers.pdf>
- Griffin, L. (2003). *Using video in the classroom*. Retrieved November 30, 2003, from <http://www.libraryvideo.com/articles/article13.asp>
- Marzano, R., Pickering, D., & Pollack, J. (2001). *Classroom Instruction That Works*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD).
- McEwan, E. (2002). *Traits of Highly Effective Teachers*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press, Inc.
- McIntosh, N. (1996). *Why do we lecture?* Retrieved October 3, 2003, from <http://www.reproline.jhu.edu/english/6read/6training/lecture/sp602web.pdf>
- Morrison, G., Ross, S., & Kemp, J. (2001). *Designing Effective Instruction—3<sup>rd</sup> Edition*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Office for Victims of Crime (2003, June). *The ultimate educator achieving maximum adult learning through training and instruction: ultimate style and skill*. Retrieved October 3, 2003, from <http://www.ojp.usdoj.gov/ovc/assist/educator/files/chapter4.pdf>
- Office of Faculty and TA Development (2001). *Teaching at the Ohio State University: A Handbook*. Retrieved October 3, 2003, from <http://www.acs.ohiostate.edu/education/ftad/Publications/TeachingHandbook/chap-3.pdf>
- Senior, B. (2002). *Developing and using video interviews for construction education*. Retrieved November 30, 2003, from <http://asceditor.unl.edu/archives/2002/senior02.htm>
- Steinbacher, K. (2002, July 7). *What good teachers say about teaching*. Retrieved October 3, 2003, from <http://teaching.berkeley.edu/goodteachers/index.html>
- Stice, J. (1998). *Ten habits of highly effective teachers*. Retrieved October 3, 2003, from [http://www.asee.org/prism/November/html/ten\\_habits\\_of\\_highly\\_effective.htm](http://www.asee.org/prism/November/html/ten_habits_of_highly_effective.htm)
- Stronge, James H. (2002). *Qualities of effective teachers*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD).



## **Acknowledgements**

We would like to thank Dr. Brent Wilson, our course instructor and department chair, for providing guidance, references, editorial support, and encouragement as our research effort evolved. To cohorts, Lisa Foegen and Linda Wooten, thank you for your extraordinary kindness in providing books and reference materials. To Kelly Arthur and Brian Knowles, thank you for sharing your comments and editorial assistance as we compiled our findings.

Next, we would like to thank the ten expert practitioners who unselfishly gave of their valuable time to answer our questions and give unsolicited advice. Special thanks are extended to Jackie Dobrovlny, Mo Mahaney, Douglas McCord, and Tamara Maccalous for their willingness to have their interviews video recorded. Without their assistance, our research would not have been possible.

Finally, we would like to thank all the cohorts in our class at the University of Colorado at Denver. It is a pleasure to work with, laugh with, and share educational experiences with all of you. It is a blessing that our lives have crossed paths.

## Appendix A

### *Questions for Esteemed Advisors*

1. With regard to effective educational practitioners, please name the three most exceptional people in your area of instruction?

Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Job Title: \_\_\_\_\_

Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Job Title: \_\_\_\_\_

Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Job Title: \_\_\_\_\_

2. In your opinion, what characteristics do you think they possess that make them extraordinary?

## Appendix B

### *Questions for Expert Practitioners*

**Name:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Educational background:** \_\_\_\_\_

**Current job role (title and brief summary of responsibilities):**

---

---

#### **Questions:**

1. Most people don't intend to be instructional designers/presenters; they usually end up in that position by some circuitous path or twist of fate. Tell us your story...what inspired you to become an instructor?
2. Can you remember any instructors in your past that you admired? If so, what do you remember about them that you now try to emulate?
3. Try to think back to your first job as an instructional designer/teacher. Did you feel prepared for that job? Did you feel that you could meet your employer's expectations? If not, what were your greatest anxieties and/or what part of your preparatory training do you feel was lacking?
4. What do you wish you knew then that you know now? That is, what is your biggest "aha" moment when you knew that your concept of good instruction was starting to feel right?
5. If you were asked to give a 15-minute talk to a group of graduate students in instructional design, what main topics would you like to discuss? And, of those topics, which is most important to you personally?
6. What trends in education today have promise and which are over-hyped?
7. What do you see happening in education in the next 3-5 years?
8. What courses do you think should be offered in universities to help make IDs more well-rounded and proficient as entry-level practitioners in corporate education?
9. What techniques/strategies do you employ in your teaching that help people learn more effectively? And, what do you think you do that makes people want to keep coming back to your classes?
10. What is the most encouraging thing you can tell graduate students about this field?
11. Finally, many studies have been done in an attempt to pinpoint why certain teachers are highly effective in their trade. Some teachers have dynamic personalities, while some are rather stolid, yet both are deemed effective. What do you believe is the common denominator? Why are some instructors much more successful than others?

## Appendix C

### *Desirable Characteristics of a Good Instructor*

Please rate the **main categories** in order of importance to you from 1 to 7. Then rate the **subcategories** as indicated. Save and return as an attachment to [docmunson@msn.com](mailto:docmunson@msn.com) or [debby\\_paulson@yahoo.com](mailto:debby_paulson@yahoo.com) Thank you for taking your valuable time to help us out!

#### \_\_\_ **Knowledge**

Rate from 1 to 4:

- \_\_\_ Mastery of the subject
- \_\_\_ Life long learner
- \_\_\_ Knowledge of learning styles
- \_\_\_ Knowledge of individual teaching style, strengths and weaknesses

#### \_\_\_ **Personality**

Rate from 1 to 6:

- \_\_\_ Confident
- \_\_\_ Personable – good rapport with people
- \_\_\_ Enthusiastic – develops student interest
- \_\_\_ Dynamic – holds attention
- \_\_\_ Motivational
- \_\_\_ Humorous

#### \_\_\_ **Interaction**

Rate from 1 to 4:

- \_\_\_ Instructor student interaction – gives immediate feedback and praise
- \_\_\_ Instructor group interaction – has ability to direct discussion
- \_\_\_ Approaches from a learner's perspective
- \_\_\_ Personally invested in student's welfare

\_\_\_ **Organizational Skills**

Rate from 1 to 7:

- \_\_\_ Prompt
- \_\_\_ Sets objectives and stays with them
- \_\_\_ Clarifies expectations
- \_\_\_ Teaches problem solving skills
- \_\_\_ Uses a variety of instructional strategies
- \_\_\_ Uses teaching aides effectively
- \_\_\_ Summarizes and reviews

\_\_\_ **Speaking Skills**

Rate from 1 to 4:

- \_\_\_ Good speaking ability – clear and understandable
- \_\_\_ Expresses ideas in simplest possible language
- \_\_\_ Non-verbal behavior – gestures, movement, eye contact
- \_\_\_ Paces appropriately with pauses to check comprehension and student engagement

\_\_\_ **Assessment Skills**

Rate from 1 to 2:

- \_\_\_ Assesses fairly and relevantly
- \_\_\_ Constructs valid tests

\_\_\_ **Leadership Skills**

Rate from 1 to 8:

- \_\_\_ Role model – teaches and leads by example
- \_\_\_ Respects learners
- \_\_\_ Good classroom management techniques –governs justly
- \_\_\_ Affirms the importance of integrity
- \_\_\_ Fosters a love of learning
- \_\_\_ Fosters an environment of trust
- \_\_\_ Encourages student responsibility
- \_\_\_ Uses an analytical approach

## Appendix D

### *Desirable Characteristics of a Good Instructor - Survey Results*

<b>1</b>	1, 1, 0, 1, 3, 1, 1 = 8 Rate from 1 to 4:	<b>Knowledge</b>
1	1, 1, 1, 1, 3, 1, 1 = 9	Mastery of the subject
2	4, 2, 2, 2, 2, 3, 2 = 17	Life long learner
4	3, 4, 4, 4, 1, 4, 3 = 23	Knowledge of learning styles
3	2, 3, 3, 3, 4, 2, 4 = 21	Knowledge of individual teaching style, strengths and weaknesses
<b>5/6</b>	3, 7, 0, 5, 4, 6, 3 = 28 Rate from 1 to 6:	<b>Personality</b>
3	4, 3, 4, 1, 1, 2, 3 = 18	Confident
2	1, 1, 2, 4, 2, 1, 5 = 16	Personable – good rapport with people
1	3, 2, 1, 2, 3, 3, 1 = 15	Enthusiastic – develops student interest
4	2, 5, 3, 3, 4, 4, 2 = 23	Dynamic – holds attention
5	5, 4, 5, 5, 5, 5, 4 = 33	Motivational
6	6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6 = 42	Humorous
<b>3</b>	4, 2, 0, 4, 2, 5, 5 = 25 Rate from 1 to 4:	<b>Interaction</b>
2	1, 3, 1, 3, 3, 2, 3 = 16	Instructor student interaction – gives immediate feedback and praise
4	1, 4, 2, 4, 4, 3, 2 = 20	Instructor group interaction – has ability to direct discussion
1	1, 1, 3, 2, 2, 1, 1 = 11	Approaches from a learner's perspective
3	1, 2, 4, 1, 1, 4, 4 = 17	Personally invested in student's welfare
<b>5/6</b>	5, 5, 0, 3, 7, 4, 4 = 28 Rate from 1 to 7:	<b>Organizational Skills</b>
6	5, 4, 6, 5, 6, 6, 7 = 39	Prompt
1	2, 1, 3, 2, 3, 1, 4 = 16	Sets objectives and stays with them
3	1, 2, 5, 1, 5, 4, 5 = 23	Clarifies expectations
4	3, 5, 4, 6, 2, 5, 1 = 26	Teaches problem solving skills
2	7, 3, 1, 3, 1, 3, 2 = 20	Uses a variety of instructional strategies

5	4, 6, 2, 7, 4, 2, 3 = 28	Uses teaching aides effectively
7	6, 7, 7, 4, 7, 7, 6 = 44	Summarizes and reviews
<b>4</b>	2, 4, 0, 6, 6, 3, 6 = 27	<b>Speaking Skills</b>
	Rate from 1 to 4:	
2	1, 2, 1, 3, 4, 2, 2 = 15	Good speaking ability – clear and understandable
1	2, 1, 4, 1, 3, 1, 1 = 13	Expresses ideas in simplest possible language
4	4, 3, 3, 4, 1, 3, 4 = 22	Non-verbal behavior – gestures, movement, eye contact
3	3, 4, 2, 2, 2, 4, 3 = 20	Paces appropriately with pauses to check comprehension and student engagement
<b>7</b>	7, 6, 0, 7, 5, 7, 7 = 39	<b>Assessment Skills</b>
	Rate from 1 to 2:	
2	2, 1, 2, 1, 2, 2, 2 = 12	Assesses fairly and relevantly
1	1, 2, 1, 2, 1, 1, 1 = 9	Constructs valid tests
<b>2</b>	6, 3, 0, 2, 1, 2, 2 = 16	<b>Leadership Skills</b>
	Rate from 1 to 8:	
2	3, 5, 1, 3, 5, 1, 1 = 19	Role model – teaches and leads by example
1	1, 4, 2, 2, 3, 2, 3 = 17	Respects learners
6	2, 8, 6, 6, 7, 5, 6 = 40	Good classroom management techniques – governs justly
7	7, 6, 5, 5, 6, 6, 7 = 42	Affirms the importance of integrity
3	5, 1, 7, 1, 2, 3, 4 = 23	Fosters a love of learning
4	4, 2, 8, 7, 1, 4, 2 = 28	Fosters an environment of trust
5	6, 3, 3, 4, 4, 7, 5 = 32	Encourages student responsibility
8	8, 7, 4, 8, 8, 8, 8 = 51	Uses an analytical approach

## Appendix E

**Table 1. Common keywords and phrases among interviewees**

	<b>Jackie Dobrovolny</b>	<b>Tammy Maccalous</b>	<b>Mo Mahaney</b>	<b>Doug McCord</b>
<b>Advice to graduate students</b>	learn skills: instructional design models, analysis, evaluation, message design, team building, interviewing, organizational change	teach how to learn, problem solving	teach problem solving  learn skills: message design, interface design, communication is key – ask questions	be a constant learner
<b>Characteristics of an effective teacher</b>	listen – know your audience	creativity – change it up, humorous personality	listen – know your audience, creativity – change it up, great communicators	creativity – change it up, know your audience, keep energy high
<b>Biggest problem in the field</b>	no common terminology	more about learning, less about achievement	confuse creativity with use of media, driven by content instead of the problem	CBT can be over-hyped, instructors don't ask enough questions
<b>Best Strategy</b>	listen relate	systematic approach, discovery learning	systematic approach, define the problem, work backwards, discovery learning, try everything, be as conversational as possible	relate to the learners  engage the learners  human connection
<b>Common denominator of effective teachers</b>	listen to students and their needs	engage the learners, passionate, love what they are doing	like what they are doing	rich instruction, engages the learners
<b>Best new trend</b>		staff development, collaborative community, mentorship		backtracking from CBT
<b>Courses to take</b>	instructional models, analysis, evaluation, message design, team building, interviewing		test writing, message design, analysis	
<b>Mentorship</b>		Critical to have a role model, mentor	creative role models	role modeling



## Appendix F

### *Model Release Form*

The undersigned enters into this Agreement with Debby Paulson and Dale Munson ("Producer"). I have been informed and understand that Producer is producing a videotape program and that my name, likeness, image, voice, appearance and/or performance are being recorded and made a part of that production, ("Product").

1. I grant the Producer and its designees the right to use my name, likeness, image, voice, appearance, and performance as embodied in the Product whether recorded on or transferred to videotape, film, slides, photographs, audio tapes, or other media, now known or later developed. This grant includes without limitation the right to edit, mix or duplicate and to use or re-use the Product in whole or part as Producer may elect. Producer or its designee shall have complete ownership of the Product in which I appear, including copyright interests, and I acknowledge that I have no interest or ownership in the Product or its copyright.

2. I also grant Producer and its designees the right to broadcast, exhibit, market, sell and otherwise distribute the Product, either in whole or in parts, and either alone or with other products, for commercial or non-commercial television or theater, closed-circuit exhibition, home video distribution or any other purpose that Producer or its designees in their sole discretion may determine. This grant includes the right to use the Product for promoting or publicizing any of the uses.

3. I confirm that I have the right to enter into this Agreement, that I am not restricted by any commitments to their parties, and that Producer has no financial commitment or obligations to me as a result of this Agreement. I hereby give all clearances, copyright and otherwise, for use of my name likeness, image, voice, appearance and performance embodied in the Product. I expressly release and indemnify Producer and its officers, employees, agents and designees from any and all claims known and unknown arising out of or in any way connected with the above granted uses and representations. The rights granted Producer herein are perpetual and worldwide.

4. In consideration of all the above, I hereby acknowledge receipt of reasonable and fair consideration from the Producer.

I have read the foregoing and understand its terms and stipulations and agree to all of them:

Model's Name (Please Print) \_\_\_\_\_

Signature of Model \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

## Appendix G

### *Expert Opinions on Instructional Effectiveness*

*The following pages contain comments about what constitutes instructional effectiveness.*

**James Stice** [http://www.asee.org/prism/November/html/ten\\_habits\\_of\\_highly\\_effective.htm](http://www.asee.org/prism/November/html/ten_habits_of_highly_effective.htm)

1. Know what you're talking about
2. Teach and lead by example
3. Respect your students
4. Motivate your students
5. Construct a set of instructional objectives for each of your courses
6. Teach students problem-solving skills
7. Tell and show
8. Read up on learning styles
9. Teach your students something about learning
10. Construct valid tests

**Autar Kaw** <http://web.tampabay.rr.com/skaw/sevenhabits.html>

1. Organized
2. Understand the importance of the first day of class
3. Uses teaching tools effectively
4. Compassionate
5. Gives rapid feedback
6. Asks questions
7. Has high expectations

**Author unknown**

<http://www.acs.ohiostate.edu/education/ftad/Publications/TeachingHandbook/chap-3.pdf>

1. Begin class promptly and get down to business
2. Teach at an appropriately fast pace, but stop regularly to check student comprehension and engagement
3. Use a variety of instructional strategies rather than lecture alone
4. Focus on instructional objectives and don't get sidetracked
5. Use humor effectively

6. Good classroom management techniques, holding the attention and respect of the group
7. Good interaction with students; providing immediate feedback, praise, and probing questions
8. Provide a warm classroom climate, allowing students to speak freely and encourage open expression
9. Good use of nonverbal gestures, such as eye contact and walking around

**Chickering & Gamson**

<http://www.acs.ohiostate.edu/education/ftad/Publications/TeachingHandbook/chap-3.pdf>

1. Knowledge of subject matter
2. Organizational skills
3. Enthusiasm
4. Clarity
5. Interpersonal Skills

**Joseph Lowman**

<http://www.acs.ohiostate.edu/education/ftad/Publications/TeachingHandbook/chap-3.pdf>

**Intellectual Excitement**

1. Enthusiasm
2. Knowledge
3. Inspiration
4. Humor
5. Interesting viewpoints
6. Clarity
7. Organization

**Interpersonal Concern/Effective Motivation**

1. Concern
2. Caring
3. Availability
4. Friendliness
5. Accessible
6. Encouraging
7. Challenging

**Kat Koppett**

<http://www.managersforum.com/astd/20012002/Trainers%20Quick%20Reference.htm>

1. Educate yourself
2. Respect your participants
3. Frame instruction in terms of participants' needs
4. Debrief the students to get feedback
5. Practice what you preach
6. Be a business person
7. Improvise

**Author Unknown**

<http://www.ojp.usdoj.gov/ovc/assist/educator/files/chapter4.pdf>

1. Students fully understand what is expected of them
2. Objectives are clearly stated
3. Instruction is based on learners needs and wants
4. Students are given the opportunity to practice
5. Students are given immediate feedback
6. Students are treated with respect
7. Students are made to feel like they are the most important people in the room
8. Students are valued

**Frank O'Meara**

<http://www.ojp.usdoj.gov/ovc/assist/educator/files/chapter4.pdf>

Ten rules for novice trainers to assist them in getting off on the right foot as trainers. These rules should also serve as a good reminder to veteran trainers to keep their attention where it belongs—on the learners. These rules will not make you instantly successful, but they may help in avoiding some pitfalls.

1. ***Change your shoes***      Imagine yourself as a member of your audience and see the subject material from their point of view.
2. ***Get your act together***      Know your stuff.
3. ***Loosen up***      Hang loose and smile.
4. ***Un-complicate it***      Express your ideas in the simplest possible language.
5. ***Put it on ice***      Motivate your audience to make them feel it is *their* program.
6. ***Vary your pitch***      Be comfortable with several different teaching techniques so as to maintain and renew interest and participation during the day.

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| 7. <b><i>Let George do it</i></b>        | Until they tell you, show you, and do it themselves, they have not acquired knowledge or mastered the skill you want them to learn. |
| 8. <b><i>Play it again, Sam</i></b>      | Repetition is the mother of learning.   |
| 9. <b><i>Accentuate the positive</i></b> | Be patient and positive in trying to ensure each individual's comprehension and proficiency.  |
| 10. <b><i>Get a receipt</i></b>          | The point of the training session is to make sure participants know what they are supposed to know.                                 |

**Garry Mitchell**

<http://www.ojp.usdoj.gov/ovc/assist/educator/files/chapter4.pdf>

1. Setting the agenda and keeping track of time
2. Maintaining training objectives
3. Protecting the rights of all participants
4. Listening
5. Summarizing the material
6. Reviewing
7. Focusing the attention on the group
8. Handling challenges to your authority
9. Involving silent members
10. Provide a solid *modus operandi*

**Various Authors**

[http://www.lgu.ac.uk/deliberations/teachers/Debate/excellent\\_teachers2.html](http://www.lgu.ac.uk/deliberations/teachers/Debate/excellent_teachers2.html)

*Student opinions on good instructors*

1. An excellent teacher is one who recognizes the important point that if there is no learning, then there is no teaching. There is no other point to teaching. Therefore, excellent teachers are ones who focus their energies, not on being a good performer or one who achieves high student ratings (though these should not be ignored), but on maximizing student learning. We do that by getting students off their tails in the passive note taking lecture and putting them into as many useful, enjoyable, practical learning experiences as possible. The more we recognize that students learn nearly nothing in lectures, but learn most things in interactive sessions with instructors and peers, and spend our time constructing such sessions, the more "excellent" we are. And, in case there are those who say such is not possible with large classes, many are doing these things with classes of 500 students and more. --*Martin*
2. An excellent teacher is one who is prepared to 'walk an extra mile' with the student. That is to say, the teacher acknowledges that the student lives within a world/world-view and that their (academic) learning is one small part of that world. An excellent teacher will make the teaching-learning process relevant to the student's world. --*Kisane*
3. I think that excellence in teaching has something to do with an individual, the teacher, having clear and strongly held opinions about issues surrounding her subject, in addition to the knowledge of subject that goes without saying. Even when these opinions are different from

those held by the student, the clarity and passion of the teacher gives the student a model to emulate whether or not they ever agree. --Nancy

**Unknown Author** [http://www.lgu.ac.uk/deliberations/teachers/Debate/excellent\\_teachers2.html](http://www.lgu.ac.uk/deliberations/teachers/Debate/excellent_teachers2.html)

Principles of good teaching:

1. Listening to students and learning from them.
2. Affirming the strength and potential of students.
3. Being knowledgeable about students and about what helps them to learn particular topics and concepts.
4. Having appropriately high expectations of students.
5. Making it clear what these expectations are.
6. Using a range of carefully chosen and appropriate teaching and assessment strategies.
7. Actively involving students in learning through methods such as case studies, discussion, group projects and problem-solving.
8. Using assessment to help students to learn, to become more responsible for their own learning and to encourage them to integrate theory and practice.
9. Providing ample feedback on student learning so that students know where they have gone wrong.
10. Skillfully varying the degree of control over, and the independence given to students, depending on their level of experience, attainment and preparedness.
11. Continually improving professional practice through reflection, discussion and innovation.
12. Actively searching for new ways to help students to learn and seeking opportunities to share their ideas with other teachers.
13. Working, collaboratively, as a team member with subject and course colleagues to plan and to develop the total experience of the student.

**Various Authors** <http://teaching.berkeley.edu/goodteachers/index.html>

**1. The teacher's main task is to guide students through the learning process, not to dispense information:**

"Teaching is not about imparting information. Teaching is about giving students room to learn how to think for themselves."

". . . teaching is less a matter of professing than it is finding means for students to discover their own virtuousness."

". . . I am on hand not to argue positions or provide entertainment but to facilitate an encounter between texts and minds."

**2. The goal of teaching is to help students read, speak, write, and think critically—and to expect students to do these things:**

". . . I see it as one of my prime duties as a scholar-teacher to stretch [students'] abilities, open their eyes, and require of them as much as I think they can produce."

"The amount of information imparted in the classroom is less important than the dialogue we begin with our students, that collective intellectual enterprise in which we seek to foster critical thinking and experimentation with new ideas, in which we engage our students in that elusive pursuit of the truth, wherever it may lead."

**3. Learning is a "messy" process, and the search for truth and knowledge is open-ended:**

"The very impossibility of ever arriving at an account of a tradition or of ways of looking for once and for all, the contingency of it all and yet the persistence of our attempts to do so is at the center of all my teaching."

"In dealing with any really hard problem, most scholars will probably admit they do not know of a single right solution . . . Students should not be given the impression that they have arrived nowhere simply because no single right solution has been found."

"Just as in real life, my problems may have several answers. This irritates everyone; students want precise, tidy problems. But my job is to teach them how to take messy, vague questions and transform them into a precise model which can then be attacked."

**4. Good teachers love their subject matter:**

"Here is my advice. Don't teach if you don't like the subject matter. If you love it, don't hide it. Wear your zeal on your sleeve, shout it, show it, sing it. The rest will take care of itself."

"A short philosophy of teaching might be, 'Love your subject and convey that love; all else is secondary.'"

". . . we have a unique power to make our classes come alive with the excitement of discovery and the love of creative learning that drive our own lives."

**5. Good research and good teaching go hand in hand. Students' engagement with the subject is enhanced by knowing about the teacher's own research, and the interaction with students often provides new insights into the research:**

"My experience as a professor and as Chancellor contradicts the popular misconception that teaching and research conflict with one another. Exciting classes stimulate scholarship, and active research enriches teaching."

"Presenting recent research in classes adds a sense that we are all still learning, not just reviewing knowledge, and student response has been enthusiastic."

"The integration of research and teaching has been for me a two-way process. Not only have I involved students in my research and related my research to my teaching; I have also participated in and learned much from student research projects. Most of my work related to student research has been at the undergraduate level. I think undergraduate students are capable of doing original research and have encouraged them to participate in the advancement of knowledge."

**6. The best teachers genuinely respect students and their intellectual capabilities:**

"I insist upon taking students seriously—seriously enough to argue with them, seriously enough to snap their heads off if they cannot show me logical bases for their assertions, and seriously enough to retreat in open confusion when they disagree with me and show me I have in fact misunderstood the materials I have presented."

"Few things can compete with the teaching of eager, talented, well-prepared and demanding students that crave, in fact, demand, precision and excellence . . . How lucky I really am."

**7. Good teachers are rarely satisfied with their teaching. They constantly evaluate and modify what they do:**

"There is no room for complacency in teaching, and that's one of the things I love about it."

"At any given moment I may feel that I am not doing a good job in my courses, and feel my preparations are inadequate, or that I am giving students short shrift. I realize I have thought this about my teaching during every term of every year since I started to teach."

**8. Good teachers usually had good teachers, and they see themselves as passing on their own teachers' gifts to a new generation of students:**

"As I watched my teacher think out loud, inviting us to think with him about the material, I suddenly got the point. Instead of trying to fit some new material into my scholarly bag of knowledge, or attempting to come up with a response, I allowed my teacher's passion, his sense of wonder, to inhabit me. That kind of experience is what I try to offer students in my teaching."

"For many of us, it was the special things that happened with teachers that shaped our paths to success. My aim is to offer the best that I was served."

**9. Good teachers treasure the small moments of discovery in the classroom and the more enduring effect they have on students' lives:**

"But the true rewards, the point of it all, are those moments of insight when a student suddenly brightens with radiant excitement and says, 'Oh, now I get it!' and does 'get' something to which access had been blocked. A small miracle."

"Teachers live for moments . . . when realization glows like a cartoon light bulb over a student's head."

"I have watched students learn things I never knew while I was supposedly teaching them, and do things that may well be beyond my capabilities while I was supposedly directing their research. And I have watched them continue that performance for years after leaving Berkeley. There is an enormous satisfaction in that."

**10. Good teachers do not see teaching as separate from other activities; rather, they see their lives as remarkably integrated:**

"The activity of teaching seems to me particularly blessed, for it allows me to spend my time with what I love and gives a oneness to my life that students value—in the literal sense, appreciate. One might say that my business is my hobby—or that I have no hobbies. I am always working—or never working. Whatever the formulation, the result is a wholeness to one's intellectual, even one's physical life."



Among the number of suggestions we received while preparing this book, several stood out. The introduction, one faculty member said, should take the high ground; make a case for excellence in teaching. Another suggested that we convey what it really means to be a teacher. Still another suggested we refer to the great thinkers throughout time and their attitudes on teaching. However, the statements compiled here do all of that and more.

Finally, one contributor to this book probably spoke for many or all of them in a note attached to his statement:

"Our teaching has been 'distinguished' only because of the high quality of the students with whom we have had the opportunity to interact."

Another contributor caught the same note and offered a sentence from Carolus Linnaeus (1707–1778):

"A professor can never better distinguish himself in his work than by encouraging a clever pupil, for the true discoverers is among them, as comets amongst the stars."

**Dale Munson**      [From personal experience](#)

1. Good grasp of subject material (subject-matter expert).
2. Knows the “ins” and “outs” of the equipment, system, or topic. Is able to teach the little secrets not found in the learner workbooks or technical documentation.
3. Make a real-world connection to what the audience is learning, both in the class and laboratory sessions.
4. Good at making learners feel comfortable (ice breakers, stories, analogies, etc)
5. Good sense of humor
6. Subject is geared to the target audience.
7. Presents the total picture of the course and continually lets you know where you are on the course roadmap.
8. Good story teller—both on and off the subject. Able to relate stories to personal experiences.
9. Good visual aids (objects, transparencies, PowerPoint, etc). The ability to communicate visually.
10. Good, relevant handouts or workbook materials that supplement the technical documentation.
11. Many, many analogies/metaphors and graphical representations.
12. Is punctual. Learners know when class is going to be over and when to expect breaks. Knowing these times stops the students from thinking about them.
13. Genuinely concerned about learners “getting” the information. S/he will spend extra time after class, if necessary, to ensure comprehension. Students don’t care how much you know until they know how much you care.
14. Enthusiastic about the need/usefulness of the material being presented... and never loses that enthusiasm in subsequent classes.

15. Skilled in Instructional System Design (ISD) principles and applications. Good instructors know how to structure his/her course to meet the audience's expectations.
16. Presentation mechanics (e.g., gestures, use of presentation equipment, voice projection, etc).
17. Personality. Good instructors have enthusiasm.
18. Altruistic. Good instructors genuinely care about their students and value their time. They strongly desire that their students get the maximum amount of information.
19. Creative. Good instructors know how to create an effective classroom climate and to express ideas in a number of ways.
20. Perceptive of what does and does not work in the classroom or multimedia learning session.
21. Chameleon. Instructors who are able to change to meet the needs of the audience (adaptive).
22. Finally, good instructors are good entertainers. People want to be entertained; they want to feel something. Why are movie stars and athletes paid a lot of money? Because they entertain us.